

4174

**Next Date:
06/10/2023**

**NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL
WESTERN ZONE BENCH, PUNE**

O.A. NO. 65 / 2019 (WZ)

BETWEEN

Ajay Bhosale & Ors. Applicant

Versus

Union of India & Ors. Respondent

**SUBMISSION OF DOCUMENTS BY
RESPONDENT NO. 11 - BRAMHACORP LTD.**

INDEX

Sr.	Particulars	Page
1.	ANNEXURE – A 2023/09/08 Minutes of 178 th SEAC-3 Meeting imposing 'Environmental Damage Cost' and Penalty, both, on the 'Project Proponent'	4176-4200

Date : **04/10/2023**

Place : **Pune**

Filed by :



Raghunath B. Mahabal

रघुनाथ भालचंद्र महाबळ

B.E.(Mechanical), M.E.(Industrial Management) VJTI Mumbai,
Fellow of Institution of Engineers, Chartered Engineer
LL.M. (Environmental & Criminal Law), Arbitrator IIE, India

A-201/2/3, B-201/2/3, B-302, Chandravijay Society,
Mahatma Fule Road, Mulund East, Mumbai-400081.

+91-74-0011-6222 adv.rbmahabal@gmail.com

MOST RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED:

- 1.** The '**Project Proponent**' Respondent **No.11 M/s BramhaCorp Ltd.** applied to SEAC-3 / SEIAA-Maharashtra for obtaining 'Environmental Clearance' for their both projects.
- 2.** This was done as per MoEFCC OM 07/07/2021 and 20/01/2022 for handling violation cases.
- 3.** As per the detailed procedure followed in such cases, the SEAC-3 has appraised the submissions on record and recommended the proposal to SEIAA. The detailed procedure has been submitted by Respondent on 28/07/2023 on Page No. 1951.
- 4.** The SEAC-3 has imposed, after detailed calculations, Rs.237.2 lakhs and Rs.74.18 lakhs as 'Environmental Damage Cost' and Penalty Cost. i.e. **Total EDC + Penalty of Rs.311.38 lakhs.**
- 5.** The detailed Minutes of Meeting are submitted on record.

Date : **04/10/2023**
Place : **Pune**



Raghunath Mahabal
Advocate for Respondent No. 11

3. ~~PP to submit the details about approach road.~~
4. ~~PP to provide electric charging facility by providing charging points at suitable places as per Maharashtra Electric Vehicle Policy, 2021.~~
5. ~~PP to ensure that, the water proposed to be used for construction phase should not be drinking water. They can use recycled water or tanker water for proposed construction.~~

Decision: -

~~After deliberation, Committee decided to recommend the proposal for Environmental Clearance to SEIAA, subject to compliance of above points.~~

Bramha Exuberance

8	SIA/MH/INFRA2/432570/2023	Proposed residential project Bramha Exuberance at S. No. 13, H. No. 1, 2 & 3, Village- Kondhwa Khurd, Taluka Haveli, District Pune, Maharashtra by BramhaCorp Ltd.
---	-------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Representative of PP was present during the meeting along with environmental consultant M/s. Mahabal Enviro Engineers Pvt. Ltd.

It is noted that, the PP has submitted the application for prior Environment Clearance under Violation Category as per Office Memorandum dated 07.07.2021, with total plot area of 17,433.10m², FSI area 21,798.69m², Non FSI area 28,749.68 m² and total BUA of 50,548.37 m².

Brief information of the proposal is as below:

1	Proposal Number	SIA/MH/INFRA2/432570/2023									
2	Name of Project	Proposed residential project "Bramha Exuberance" at S. No. 13, H. No. 1, 2 & 3, Village- Kondhwa Khurd, Taluka Haveli, District Pune, Maharashtra by BramhaCorp Ltd.									
3	Project Category	8(a) B2 Category									
4	Type of Institution	Private									
5	Name of Project Proponent	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Name</td> <td>Mr. Sachin Shah</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regd. Office address</td> <td>The Residency Club, 3 Queen's Garden Road, Pune Maharashtra 411001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Contact number</td> <td>020-41423333</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Email ID</td> <td>ec@bramhacorp.in</td> </tr> </table>		Name	Mr. Sachin Shah	Regd. Office address	The Residency Club, 3 Queen's Garden Road, Pune Maharashtra 411001	Contact number	020-41423333	Email ID	ec@bramhacorp.in
Name	Mr. Sachin Shah										
Regd. Office address	The Residency Club, 3 Queen's Garden Road, Pune Maharashtra 411001										
Contact number	020-41423333										
Email ID	ec@bramhacorp.in										
6	Consultant	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Name</td> <td>Mahabal Enviro Engineers Pvt. Ltd.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Address</td> <td>Plot F-7, Road No. 21, Wagle Estate, Thane (West)-400604</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Telephone</td> <td>022-25823154</td> </tr> </table>		Name	Mahabal Enviro Engineers Pvt. Ltd.	Address	Plot F-7, Road No. 21, Wagle Estate, Thane (West)-400604	Telephone	022-25823154		
Name	Mahabal Enviro Engineers Pvt. Ltd.										
Address	Plot F-7, Road No. 21, Wagle Estate, Thane (West)-400604										
Telephone	022-25823154										

		Email ID	mahabal.thane@gmail.com																													
		QCI Accreditation Status	QCI NABET Accreditation QCI/NABET/ENV/ACO/23/2853 Re-Accreditation dated 11.08.2023 valid up 10.11.2023																													
7	Applied for	Environmental Clearance																														
8	Details of previous EC	NA																														
9	Location of project	Sr. No.13, H. No. 1, 2, & 3 of Village- Kondhwa Khurd, Taluka- Haveli, Pune, Maharashtra																														
10	Latitude and Longitude	18°28'31.22"N, 73°53'42.44"E																														
11	Total Plot area (m ²)	17,433.10 m ²																														
12	Deductions (m ²)	2,833.35 m ²																														
13	Net Plot Area (m ²)	14,599.75 m ²																														
14	Proposed FSI Area (m ²)	21,798.69 m ²																														
15	Proposed Non-FSI Area (m ²)	28,749.68 m ²																														
16	Proposed Total BUA area (m ²)	50,548.37 m ²																														
17	TBUA (m ²) approved by Planning Authority till date	14,805.95 m ² (FSI area) as per Sanctioned plan No. DPO5191/VI/39 dated 14.09.2005 & 50,548.37 m ² as per sanction no. CC/0819/17 dated 21.06.2017.																														
18	Total ground coverage (m ²) & %	3,007.72 m ² (21 %) of total net plot area																														
19	Total project cost (Rs.)	Rs.50.21 Crore																														
20	CER as per MoEF & CC Circular dated 01.05.2018	Not applicable																														
21	Details of Building Configuration	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sr.</th> <th>Building Name</th> <th>Configuration</th> <th>Height (m)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>A Building</td> <td>LP + P +11 floors</td> <td>34.90</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>B Building</td> <td>LP + P +11 floors</td> <td>34.90</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>C Building</td> <td>LP + P +11 floors</td> <td>34.90</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4.</td> <td>D Building</td> <td>LB + LP + P + 11 floors</td> <td>34.90</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5.</td> <td>E Building</td> <td>LP + P +11 floors</td> <td>34.90</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6.</td> <td>Club House</td> <td>G + 1</td> <td>7</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>			Sr.	Building Name	Configuration	Height (m)	1	A Building	LP + P +11 floors	34.90	2	B Building	LP + P +11 floors	34.90	3	C Building	LP + P +11 floors	34.90	4.	D Building	LB + LP + P + 11 floors	34.90	5.	E Building	LP + P +11 floors	34.90	6.	Club House	G + 1	7
Sr.	Building Name	Configuration	Height (m)																													
1	A Building	LP + P +11 floors	34.90																													
2	B Building	LP + P +11 floors	34.90																													
3	C Building	LP + P +11 floors	34.90																													
4.	D Building	LB + LP + P + 11 floors	34.90																													
5.	E Building	LP + P +11 floors	34.90																													
6.	Club House	G + 1	7																													
22	Total number of tenements/shops/offices	Tenements: 249 Nos.																														
	Number of expected residents / users	Total Population: 1,432 Nos.																														
23	Water Budget																															
		Dry Season		Wet Season																												
	Freshwater (in m ³ /day)	123 m ³ /day		123 m ³ /day																												
	Recycled water (Flushing)	62 m ³ /day		62 m ³ /day																												

	Recycled water (Gardening)	20 m ³ /day	10 m ³ /day						
	Swimming pool	NA	NA						
	Total water requirement	185 m ³ /day	185 m ³ /day						
	Wastewater generation	173 m ³ /day	173 m ³ /day						
24	Water Storage Capacity for Firefighting								
	Firefighting (Underground water tank)	250 m ³							
	Firefighting (Overhead water tank)	125 m ³							
24	Source of water	Pune Municipal Corporation							
25	Rain Water Harvesting (RWH)								
	i) Level of the groundwater table	Groundwater table: Summer Season – 18.67 m. to 25.00 m. BGL. (21.84 M. Average) Rainy Season – 7.00 m. to 10.00 m. BGL. (8.50 M. Average) Winter Season – 12.84 m. to 17.50 m. BGL. (15.17 M. Average)							
	ii) Size and no of RWH tank(s) and Quantity	NA							
	iii) Quantity and size of recharge pits	Total 3 nos. of recharge pits: (Existing Pits 2 No's & Proposed Pit 1 No.) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 for Roof-Top (Roof-Top recharge pit size - 1.25 m x 1.25 m x 1.00 m) • 2 for existing Surface Run-Off (Surface Run-Off recharge pit size - 1.25 m x 1.25 m x 1.25 m) 							
	iv) Details of UGT tanks if any:	Domestic UG tank capacity: 189 m ³ Flushing UG tank capacity: 47.2 m ³ Firefighting UG tank capacity: 250 m ³							
26	Sewage and wastewater Demand	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 60%;">i) Sewage generation in KLD</td> <td>173 m³/day</td> </tr> <tr> <td>ii) STP technology</td> <td>MBBR</td> </tr> <tr> <td>iii) No. and Capacity of STP</td> <td>1 no. x 70 m³/day Existing 1 no. x 115 m³/day Proposed</td> </tr> </table>		i) Sewage generation in KLD	173 m ³ /day	ii) STP technology	MBBR	iii) No. and Capacity of STP	1 no. x 70 m ³ /day Existing 1 no. x 115 m ³ /day Proposed
i) Sewage generation in KLD	173 m ³ /day								
ii) STP technology	MBBR								
iii) No. and Capacity of STP	1 no. x 70 m ³ /day Existing 1 no. x 115 m ³ /day Proposed								
27	Solid Waste Management during Construction phase: 0 kg/day								
28	Solid Waste Management during operation Phase:								
	Type	Quantity (kg/day)	Treatment/disposal						
	Total waste generation	699 kg/day							
	Wet waste	419 kg/day	Through vermicomposting pit. Generated manure used for gardening.						

	Dry waste	280 kg/day	Handed over to the authorized recycling agency		
	Hazardous waste	NA	NA		
	Biomedical waste	NA	NA		
	STP sludge (dry)	1.7 kg/day	Used as manure		
	E-waste	NA	NA		
29	Green Belt Development				
	Total RG area	2,045.85 m ²			
	Existing trees on plot	392			
	Number of trees to be planted	NA			
	No of trees to be retained	NA			
	Number of trees to be transplanted/cut	NA			
30	Power requirement				
	Source of power supply	MSEDCL			
	During Construction Phase (Demand Load)	NA			
	During Operation phase (Connected Load)	1,438 kW			
	During Operation phase (Demand Load)	1,007 kW			
	Transformer	2 nos. x 630 kVA			
	DG set	1 no. x 82.5 kVA			
	Fuel Used	Diesel			
31	Details of Energy saving				
	Energy Conservation Measures			Quantity	
	Energy-saving due to use of solar PV			9.27 %	
	Energy-saving due to Auto Timer Logic Controller			5.43%	
	Energy-saving due to Electronic V3F drive for Lifts			1.68%	
	Energy-saving due to Solar Water heater			3.94%	
	Overall energy saving			20.33%	
32	Environmental Management plan budget during Construction phase: NA				
33	Environmental Management plan budget during Operation phase				
	Sr.	Component	Details	Capital cost (Rs. In Lakh)	O&M cost (Rs. In Lakh/year)
	1.	Storm water management	Laying of storm & Sewer line up to final disposal point	11.00	0.90
	2.	Sewage Treatment Plant	1 no. of STP having capacity 70 m ³ /day existing & 115 m ³ /day to be proposed	32.25	1.6

	3.	Rain Water Harvesting	3 no. of recharge borewell	1.90	0.50														
	4.	Solid Waste Management	Cost for Treatment of biodegradable garbage in vermicomposting	3.00	0.40														
	5.	Landscape development	Tree Plantation	17.26	1.5														
	6.	Energy Conservation	Solar PV panels for electricity generation, LED etc.	25.00	2.6														
	7.	Environmental Monitoring	Monitoring and analysis of Air, Water, Noise, Soil, surface water, STP treated water etc.	5.00	0.5														
	8.	Firefighting system	Installation and operation of Fire Fighting system	14.50	1.7														
		Total		109.91	9.7														
34	Traffic Management:		<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Type</th> <th>Required as per DCR</th> <th>Actual Provided</th> <th>Area per parking (m²)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>4 -wheeler</td> <td>140 nos.</td> <td>233 nos.</td> <td>35 m² for basement parking, 30 m² for covered parking</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 -wheeler</td> <td>388 nos.</td> <td>411 nos.</td> <td>4.2 m²</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cycle</td> <td>388 nos.</td> <td>393 nos.</td> <td>4.2 m²</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Type	Required as per DCR	Actual Provided	Area per parking (m ²)	4 -wheeler	140 nos.	233 nos.	35 m ² for basement parking, 30 m ² for covered parking	2 -wheeler	388 nos.	411 nos.	4.2 m ²	Cycle	388 nos.	393 nos.	4.2 m ²
Type	Required as per DCR	Actual Provided	Area per parking (m ²)																
4 -wheeler	140 nos.	233 nos.	35 m ² for basement parking, 30 m ² for covered parking																
2 -wheeler	388 nos.	411 nos.	4.2 m ²																
Cycle	388 nos.	393 nos.	4.2 m ²																
35	Details of Court cases / litigations w.r.t. the project and project location if any.		Yes Court case details- NGT Western zone bench at Pune – Case no.65/2019																

Deliberations:

PP stated that, the application is a residential project located at Village- Kondhwa Khurd, Taluka Haveli, District Pune, PP further stated that, they have applied for prior EC under SOP for Identification and Handling of Violation Cases vide circular dated 07/07/2021.

PP stated that, as per sanction 2005, A & B (4 wings each), D, and E (5 wings each) buildings were constructed with 'built-up area of 39,037.99 m². PP further stated that, it comprises 4 residential buildings with 249 flats in 2005 as per the Sanctioned plan No. CC/2342/05 dated 21/9/2005 & CC/3387/05 dated 30/12/2005 and the entire work was completed in 2009.

PP stated that, the Occupancy Certificate was granted to the project on 04/12/2009 and Society registration was done on 29/08/2011 and the possession of the flats and buildings was handed over to the buyers 'residents' society in the year 2012. PP further stated that, as per sanction plan, Building No. C was constructed and the total built-up area of the C building is 11,510.38 m² with building configuration Lower Parking + Podium +1 Floors & 55 flats.

PP stated that, the 20000 m² construction area was crossed on dated 20/11/2006. PP informed that, they have submitted the violation application on PARIVESH portal as per MoEF&CC Office Memorandum dated 07/07/2021 and 28/01/2022 vide F. No. 22-21/2020-IA.III (E 138949). PP further stated that, the NGT matter OA 65/2019(WZ) Tanaji Gambhire was pending before NGT with no adverse order. NGT by Daily Order dated 09/11/2022 has stated; *"11..... However, we also deem it appropriate that the SEIAA, before which the application dated 14/01/2022 for ex-post facto Environmental Clearance is pending should be directed to decide the same within a period of one month from today, particularly in this matter and direct accordingly."*

PP informed following points:

- (i) PP have calculated violation days from first sanction plan dated 21.09.2005 to the date of the EC application dated 17.05.2022 i.e., 6,083 days.
- (ii) EIA Notification 07.07.2004 is not applicable for this project because as per this notification "any construction project falling under entry 31 of Schedule-I including new townships, industrial townships, settlement colonies, commercial complexes, hotel complexes, hospitals and office complexes, for 1,000 (one thousand) person or below or discharging sewage of 50,000 (fifty thousand) litres per day or below or with an investment of Rs.50,00,00,000/- (Rupees fifty crores) or below" and at that time the resident population of the project was below 1,000 and the sewage discharge was below 50,000 liters per day considering at least 40% of the total water requirement being met from waste recycling and rain water harvesting.
- (iii) The building configuration stated in the OC of respective buildings and the building configuration mentioned in the architect certificate is different. Though, the

nomenclature is different but built-up area in both cases is same.

- (iv) The damage assessment plan and remediation & Natural community augmentation plan is prepared as per approach paper “Assessment for Environmental Damage and Estimation of Remediation Costs for Building Construction Projects initiated without obtaining mandatory Environmental clearance (Violation Cases) dated 18.03.2019” issued by SEIAA Maharashtra.

SEAC-3 appraised the proposal as per Circular issued by SEIAA vide dated 22.08.2022. The case was discussed on the basis of the documents submitted and presentation made by the proponent. All issues relating to environment, including air, water, land, soil, ecology, biodiversity and social aspects were examined. The proposal is appraised as category 8(a) B1.

Construction status at site

Sr.	Building Name	Building configuration	Present status
1	A Building	Basement+ Podium parking + 1 st – 11 th floor	Completed (2007)
2.	B Building	Basement+ Podium parking + 1 st – 11 th floor	Completed (2007)
3.	C Building	Podium parking, 1 st – 11 th floor	Completed (2019)
4.	D Building	Lower basement parking +Upper podium parking +Podium parking + 1 st – 11 th floor	Completed (2009)
5.	E Building	Basement+ Podium parking + 1 st – 11 th floor	Completed (2007)
6.	Club House	G + 1	Completed

Construction area statement as informed by the PP is as below:

Sr	Particulars	Building A	Building B	Building C	Building D	Building E	Total
1	FSI	3191.55	3191.55	4706.14	4867.09	5443.65	21399.98
2	Excess balcony					398.71	398.71
3	Staircase	213.73	213.73	94.38	97.46	136.84	756.14
4	Lift area	10.24	10.24	7.82	10.24	10.24	48.78
5	Balcony area	564.08	564.08	692.78	846.45	928.18	3595.57

Sr	Particulars	Building A	Building B	Building C	Building D	Building E	Total
6	Lobby area	487.30	487.30	922.57	645.70	817.96	3360.83
7	Terrace area	1199.46		970.89	418.09	703.25	3291.69
8	Refuge area	73.25	73.25	25.60	72.57	99.69	344.36
9	Podium area	1464.70	3023.17		1474.18	1763.76	7725.81
10	Lift M. room	--	--	--	--	--	--
11	Built up Area of residential buildings						40921.87
12	Area of club house						310.06
13	Area of Transformer room						20
14	Area of undergrounds tanks						100
16	Area of Security cabin						25
17	Area of Parking below podium						7197.37
18	Terrace (11 th floor of each building)- A=296.80+B=296.80+C=427.47+D=449.06+E=503.94						1974.07
	Total built up area of the project						50548.37

Project details:

1	Name and address of Project	Proposed residential project "Bramha Exuberance" at S. No. 13, H. No. 1, 2 & 3, Village- Kondhwa Khurd, Taluka Haveli, District Pune, Maharashtra by Bramha Corp Ltd.	
2	Name of Directors	Mr. Sachin Shah	
3	Total construction completed (built- up area as per EC notification):	FSI area	21,798.69 m ²
		Non FSI area	28,749.68 m ²
		Total construction area	50,548.37 m ²
4	Total construction proposed, built- up area as per EC notification	FSI area	21,798.69 m ²
		Non FSI area	28,749.68 m ²
		Total construction area	50,548.37 m ²
5	Whether the project has any EC; if yes, give details including approved	No	

	built-up area																																					
6	The total cost of the project and total cost of the project already executed? Also, give total cost of the project constructed without EC.	Total cost of the project – Rs.50.21 Crore.																																				
7	<p>Date of commencement of project</p> <p>Commencement certificate details</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="width: 40%;">Building name</th> <th style="width: 30%;">File no.</th> <th style="width: 30%;">Date</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/2342/05</td> <td>21.09.2005</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/3387/05</td> <td>30.12.2005</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Club house</td> <td>CC/1246/06</td> <td>07.07.2006</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/1847/06</td> <td>28.08.2006</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/3582/06</td> <td>08.01.2007</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/0138/09</td> <td>13.04.2009</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/4370/11</td> <td>17.03.2012</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/3954/13</td> <td>04.03.2014</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/1169/14</td> <td>15.07.2014</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/3213/15</td> <td>30.12.2015</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td> <td>CC/0819/17</td> <td>21.06.2017</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Building name	File no.	Date	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/2342/05	21.09.2005	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3387/05	30.12.2005	Club house	CC/1246/06	07.07.2006	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/1847/06	28.08.2006	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3582/06	08.01.2007	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/0138/09	13.04.2009	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/4370/11	17.03.2012	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3954/13	04.03.2014	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/1169/14	15.07.2014	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3213/15	30.12.2015	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/0819/17	21.06.2017
Building name	File no.	Date																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/2342/05	21.09.2005																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3387/05	30.12.2005																																				
Club house	CC/1246/06	07.07.2006																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/1847/06	28.08.2006																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3582/06	08.01.2007																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/0138/09	13.04.2009																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/4370/11	17.03.2012																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3954/13	04.03.2014																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/1169/14	15.07.2014																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3213/15	30.12.2015																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/0819/17	21.06.2017																																				
8	Date of violation of EC regulation (please justify with documentary evidence)	First sanction plan dated 21.09.2005																																				
9	Date of first submission of information of such violation to the SEIAA or SEAC, if self- notified, along with stoppage of construction work	Date of application for EC: 17.05.2022 Completion/Stoppage of construction: Building C OC no. OCC/1333/18 dated 18.01.2019																																				
	No. of days of violation (9-8)	6,083 days																																				
10	Name and address of Environmental consultant, with date of engagement of such consultant	Mahabal Enviro Engineers Pvt. Ltd. Plot F-7, Road 21, MIDC Wagle Estate, Thane-400604 Phone: 02235087207 mahabal.thane@gmail.com																																				
11	Any other case of EC violation is reported or pending or decided earlier for projects where any of the directors are involved? If yes, give details	No																																				
12	Any court case related to EC violation pending or decided against any of the directors including High Court, NGT and sessions court?	Yes Court case details- NGT Western zone bench at Pune – Case no.65/2019																																				

Description Of Activities Contributing to the Environmental Damage And Degradation:

A.	Demolition, site preparation
-----------	-------------------------------------

1	Whether any demolition work was carried out prior to EC? If yes what is date of commencement of demolition and also date of completion of demolition?	No. The construction was done on vacant plot																																				
2	Whether such demolition or site had some asbestos, industrial waste or contaminated soil or hazardous waste etc. and if yes, how these types of waste have been segregated and disposed?	No																																				
3	If the project is located on any industrial site, whether any due diligence or environmental status of site was assessed? If yes, give details	No. The plot was vacant.																																				
4	State the quantity of demolition waste disposed from the site, including quantity and disposal location along with location map and photographs	Not applicable																																				
5	Any air quality (including noise) monitoring done during demolition work? If yes, results	Not applicable																																				
6	Whether building plan and layout approved and permission from local authorities is taken to commence the work prior to demolition work	Not applicable																																				
B. Construction stage																																						
1	Date of Commencement of construction and completion of construction, if any																																					
As per commencement certificate:																																						
<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="width: 40%;">Building name</th> <th style="width: 30%;">File no.</th> <th style="width: 30%;">Date</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/2342/05</td><td>21.09.2005</td></tr> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/3387/05</td><td>30.12.2005</td></tr> <tr><td>Club house</td><td>CC/1246/06</td><td>07.07.2006</td></tr> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/1847/06</td><td>28.08.2006</td></tr> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/3582/06</td><td>08.01.2007</td></tr> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/0138/09</td><td>13.04.2009</td></tr> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/4370/11</td><td>17.03.2012</td></tr> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/3954/13</td><td>04.03.2014</td></tr> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/1169/14</td><td>15.07.2014</td></tr> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/3213/15</td><td>30.12.2015</td></tr> <tr><td>Building A, B, C, D, E</td><td>CC/0819/17</td><td>21.06.2017</td></tr> </tbody> </table>			Building name	File no.	Date	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/2342/05	21.09.2005	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3387/05	30.12.2005	Club house	CC/1246/06	07.07.2006	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/1847/06	28.08.2006	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3582/06	08.01.2007	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/0138/09	13.04.2009	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/4370/11	17.03.2012	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3954/13	04.03.2014	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/1169/14	15.07.2014	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3213/15	30.12.2015	Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/0819/17	21.06.2017
Building name	File no.	Date																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/2342/05	21.09.2005																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3387/05	30.12.2005																																				
Club house	CC/1246/06	07.07.2006																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/1847/06	28.08.2006																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3582/06	08.01.2007																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/0138/09	13.04.2009																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/4370/11	17.03.2012																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3954/13	04.03.2014																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/1169/14	15.07.2014																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/3213/15	30.12.2015																																				
Building A, B, C, D, E	CC/0819/17	21.06.2017																																				
As per Completion certificate:																																						
<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="width: 40%;">Building name</th> <th style="width: 30%;">File no.</th> <th style="width: 30%;">Date</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Building A, B, E</td><td>BCO/14/7/148</td><td>22.10.2007</td></tr> <tr><td>Building D (Part I)</td><td>350</td><td>05.10.2009</td></tr> <tr><td>Building D (Part II)</td><td>421</td><td>04.12.2009</td></tr> <tr><td>Building C (Part I)</td><td>OCC/0717/18</td><td>01.09.2018</td></tr> <tr><td>Building C (Part II)</td><td>OCC/1333/18</td><td>18.01.2019</td></tr> </tbody> </table>			Building name	File no.	Date	Building A, B, E	BCO/14/7/148	22.10.2007	Building D (Part I)	350	05.10.2009	Building D (Part II)	421	04.12.2009	Building C (Part I)	OCC/0717/18	01.09.2018	Building C (Part II)	OCC/1333/18	18.01.2019																		
Building name	File no.	Date																																				
Building A, B, E	BCO/14/7/148	22.10.2007																																				
Building D (Part I)	350	05.10.2009																																				
Building D (Part II)	421	04.12.2009																																				
Building C (Part I)	OCC/0717/18	01.09.2018																																				
Building C (Part II)	OCC/1333/18	18.01.2019																																				

2	Whether the construction carried out is strictly as per the sanction plan given by concerned local authority? If yes, please provide such certification.	Yes, construction of residential building completed as per sanction received from Pune Municipal Corporation dated 21.09.2005, 30.12.2005, 04.03.2014, 21.06.2017.																																																																
3	In the additional construction, how much construction material including, sand, bricks, cement etc. was required to be transported? No. of truck sand it save rage haulage?	<p>Construction material for already constructed area;</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="675 443 1444 1137"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="675 443 767 521">Sr.</th> <th data-bbox="767 443 959 521">Material</th> <th data-bbox="959 443 1070 521">Unit</th> <th data-bbox="1070 443 1241 521">Total</th> <th data-bbox="1241 443 1444 521">Life Span years</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 521 767 562">1.</td> <td data-bbox="767 521 959 562">RMC</td> <td data-bbox="959 521 1070 562">cum</td> <td data-bbox="1070 521 1241 562">2,389</td> <td data-bbox="1241 521 1444 562">70</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 562 767 602">2.</td> <td data-bbox="767 562 959 602">Cement</td> <td data-bbox="959 562 1070 602">MT</td> <td data-bbox="1070 562 1241 602">8,960</td> <td data-bbox="1241 562 1444 602">70</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 602 767 680">3.</td> <td data-bbox="767 602 959 680">Fly Ash</td> <td data-bbox="959 602 1070 680">bags kg</td> <td data-bbox="1070 602 1241 680">6,65,870</td> <td data-bbox="1241 602 1444 680">70</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 680 767 721">4.</td> <td data-bbox="767 680 959 721">Gravel</td> <td data-bbox="959 680 1070 721">cum</td> <td data-bbox="1070 680 1241 721">11,639</td> <td data-bbox="1241 680 1444 721">70</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 721 767 761">5.</td> <td data-bbox="767 721 959 761">Steel</td> <td data-bbox="959 721 1070 761">MT</td> <td data-bbox="1070 721 1241 761">1,575</td> <td data-bbox="1241 721 1444 761">75</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 761 767 801">6.</td> <td data-bbox="767 761 959 801">Crush Sand</td> <td data-bbox="959 761 1070 801">cum</td> <td data-bbox="1070 761 1241 801">14,479</td> <td data-bbox="1241 761 1444 801">70</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 801 767 947">7.</td> <td data-bbox="767 801 959 947">AAC block (Autoclaved aerated concrete)</td> <td data-bbox="959 801 1070 947">cum</td> <td data-bbox="1070 801 1241 947">9,94,705</td> <td data-bbox="1241 801 1444 947">50</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 947 767 987">8.</td> <td data-bbox="767 947 959 987">River sand</td> <td data-bbox="959 947 1070 987">cum</td> <td data-bbox="1070 947 1241 987">9,210</td> <td data-bbox="1241 947 1444 987">70</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 987 767 1028">9.</td> <td data-bbox="767 987 959 1028">Tiles</td> <td data-bbox="959 987 1070 1028">m²</td> <td data-bbox="1070 987 1241 1028">54,271</td> <td data-bbox="1241 987 1444 1028">25</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 1028 767 1068">10.</td> <td data-bbox="767 1028 959 1068">Flush Doors</td> <td data-bbox="959 1028 1070 1068">m²</td> <td data-bbox="1070 1028 1241 1068">1,372</td> <td data-bbox="1241 1028 1444 1068">50</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="675 1068 767 1137">11.</td> <td data-bbox="767 1068 959 1137">Glass</td> <td data-bbox="959 1068 1070 1137">m²</td> <td data-bbox="1070 1068 1241 1137">3,114</td> <td data-bbox="1241 1068 1444 1137">70</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>					Sr.	Material	Unit	Total	Life Span years	1.	RMC	cum	2,389	70	2.	Cement	MT	8,960	70	3.	Fly Ash	bags kg	6,65,870	70	4.	Gravel	cum	11,639	70	5.	Steel	MT	1,575	75	6.	Crush Sand	cum	14,479	70	7.	AAC block (Autoclaved aerated concrete)	cum	9,94,705	50	8.	River sand	cum	9,210	70	9.	Tiles	m ²	54,271	25	10.	Flush Doors	m ²	1,372	50	11.	Glass	m ²	3,114	70
Sr.	Material	Unit	Total	Life Span years																																																														
1.	RMC	cum	2,389	70																																																														
2.	Cement	MT	8,960	70																																																														
3.	Fly Ash	bags kg	6,65,870	70																																																														
4.	Gravel	cum	11,639	70																																																														
5.	Steel	MT	1,575	75																																																														
6.	Crush Sand	cum	14,479	70																																																														
7.	AAC block (Autoclaved aerated concrete)	cum	9,94,705	50																																																														
8.	River sand	cum	9,210	70																																																														
9.	Tiles	m ²	54,271	25																																																														
10.	Flush Doors	m ²	1,372	50																																																														
11.	Glass	m ²	3,114	70																																																														
4	How many labors were engaged in construction, average per day?	100 no. of labours/ day																																																																
5	Whether, the additional construction work, over and above valid EC, if so available, has any additional ground footprint? If yes please state, ground footprint in sqm as per EC, approved layout and current proposed layout?	No																																																																
6	Whether the expansion was carried out simultaneously with EC approved work? If not give details of time frame? If yes, please give incremental additional time required for construction of additional area	No																																																																

7	Is there any change in foundation design, i.e. depth of foundation, basement etc. that were done due to additional area? If yes, what is the additional soil quantity excavated for such incremental foundation depth? Where it is disposed?	No change in foundation design.
8	What is the quantity of top soil removed and how it is managed?	920 m ³ of Top soil excavated during the construction phase of the existing building is reused for plinth filling, backfilling, landscaping & gardening.
9	Also, if water is encountered at such foundation depth, what is the volume of water pumped for such additional depth of excavation?	Groundwater was not encountered during the excavation and foundation work of completed work.
10	How much additional water was required for curing and construction purpose? Source of water?	The quantity of water required for the construction of an additional area of 1,01,097 KLD (2 KL/ m ² x 50,548.37 m ² violation area= 1,01,097 KLD) The source of water is through borewell.
11	Rain Water harvesting details	2 No. of recharge borewells were constructed on site. 1 no. of recharge pit will be constructed.
12	Solar PV panels, water heating details	We have installed solar panel for residential buildings Solar PV panels having capacity 135000 KWH/Annum. Solar water heating system having capacity 57420 KWH/Annum.
13	Use fly ash bricks ensured? Details there of	Not Applicable
14	Whether any noise or air pollution control measures taken, if so what are they?	For Noise and Air pollution control Barricading was done along the periphery of the site. Regular water sprinkling to avoid spreading of dust particles
15	Whether any air quality and noise level monitoring done during construction stage, if yes attach results	Air Pollution Control Measures <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Water sprinkling on unpaved roads to arrest air bourne dust • Covered vehicles for carrying construction materials • Sand, murrum, loose soil, cement, stored on site • covered adequately so as to prevent dust pollution. • Use of ready-mix concrete • Use of PUC certified vehicles

		<p>Noise Pollution Control Measures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Barricading to plot boundary • No excavation and foundation were done during night time • PPEs were provided to construction workers • Plantation along the plot boundary 																		
16	Whether any third-party rights are created on the construction without EC?	Not applicable																		
17	Whether any of the construction without EC has already been occupied? If yes, number of families gave such occupation. Also give total commercial area being used presently. Also, state type of commercial activity i.e. offices, shops, hotels, restaurants, etc.	Yes, 249 nos. of tenements (A building -43 nos., B building-43 nos., C building - 55 nos., D building – 54 nos., E building-43 nos.) are occupied.																		
18	How many flats sold which are in the area of EC violation and total sale value of such flats?	249 nos. of tenements are sold (A building -43 nos., B building-43 nos., C building - 55 nos., D building – 54 nos., E building-43 nos.) Total turnover=Rs.95.87 Crore																		
19	How much commercial area sold which is in area of EC violation and total sale value of such commercial area.	Not applicable																		
C	Commissioning of project																			
1	Date of when the project was made operational either by giving possession of residential or commercial areas of the project?	<p>As per Completion certificate</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Building name</th> <th>File no.</th> <th>Date</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Building A, B, E</td> <td>BCO/14/7/148</td> <td>22.10.2007</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building D (Part I)</td> <td>350</td> <td>05.10.2009</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building D (Part II)</td> <td>421</td> <td>04.12.2009</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building C (Part I)</td> <td>OCC/0717/18</td> <td>01.09.2018</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building C (Part II)</td> <td>OCC/1333/18</td> <td>18.01.2019</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Building name	File no.	Date	Building A, B, E	BCO/14/7/148	22.10.2007	Building D (Part I)	350	05.10.2009	Building D (Part II)	421	04.12.2009	Building C (Part I)	OCC/0717/18	01.09.2018	Building C (Part II)	OCC/1333/18	18.01.2019
Building name	File no.	Date																		
Building A, B, E	BCO/14/7/148	22.10.2007																		
Building D (Part I)	350	05.10.2009																		
Building D (Part II)	421	04.12.2009																		
Building C (Part I)	OCC/0717/18	01.09.2018																		
Building C (Part II)	OCC/1333/18	18.01.2019																		
2	How many families are staying in project?	249 nos. of families staying in building A, B, C, D & E.																		

3	What is total water supply to project, source and quality	Source of water – Pune Municipal Corporation. Fresh water required for the project – 123 m ³ /day Total water requirement for project 185 m ³ /day
4	Total sewage generation m ³ /day	Total sewage generation of project is 173 m ³ /day
5	STP details	Existing STP - 70 KLD Proposed STP – 115 KLD
6	Treated waste water disposal	Total sewage generated from whole project is 173 KLD and it is connected to municipal sewer line.
7	Any DG sets, are they complying the norms	Existing: We have installed 1 no. X 82.5 kVA DG set on project site.

Format of Assessment of Environmental Damage:

Attributes	Scope of saving on account of environmental protection measures	Non-recurring cost (Rs.)	Recurring cost, Rs. /day
Air Pollution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Water requirement for sprinkling (KL/day): ● Plot area of the project 17,433 m². ● Water requirement for sprinkling per m² = 2 liters (Calculated as per CSIR NEERI, Dust suppressant note_Annexure-I) ● Total water requirement for 17,433 m² = 35 KLD ● Water from borewell was used for sprinkling purpose ● As per (As per CGWA notification dt 24th September, 2020, Page No. 41 Ground water abstraction charges for infrastructure project is Rs.1/m³. However, we have considered Rs.15/m³_ Annexure-II) ● Cost of 1 KL water (Rs.) considered is Rs.15 per kL ● Recurring cost for 35 KLD water consumption = 35 KLD x Rs.15/KL =Rs.525 ● Water helped to reduce 25%-30% 	Nil	525

Attributes	Scope of saving on account of environmental protection measures	Non-recurring cost (Rs.)	Recurring cost, Rs. /day
	<p>pollutants which holds moisture for about 15 min. Application in 1 hr. in a day. i.e., total cost in rupees for 1 hr.= Rs.525 x 1 = Rs.525 day</p>		
Water Pollution	<p>A. Cost of water requirement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Construction phase: ● <u>Water requirement for labour</u> ● No. of labour = 100 nos. ● Total water consumption=4.5 KLD ● PMC domestic water supply rate is Rs.8 per m³- Annexure-III ● Cost of 1 KL water is Rs.8 ● Recurring cost for 4.5 KLD water consumption = Rs.36/day ● <u>Water requirement for construction purpose</u> ● Violation construction area=50,548.37 m² ● The water required for construction has been considered from a Research paper titled “Assessment of water resource consumption in building construction in India” - Rs. 2KL / m² - Annexure-IV ● Total water required during construction purpose =50,548.37 m² x 2KL/m²=101097 KL ● Cost for construction water=Rs.15,16,451 <p>a) Operation phase:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Building A, B, C, D & E is in under violation ● No. of flats of Building A, B, C, D & E -249 nos. (2 BHK-130 nos., 3 BHK-119 nos.) ● Total fresh water= (No of flats x residential occupancy x 90 lpd water as per NBC 2016) + 5% visitors x 5 lpd water as per NBC 2016 = (130 x 5 x 90) + (119 x 6 x 90) + 68 x 	<p>15,16,451</p> <p>69,513</p>	<p>36</p> <p>984</p>

Attributes	Scope of saving on account of environmental protection measures	Non-recurring cost (Rs.)	Recurring cost, Rs. /day
	<p>5 = 123 KLD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● PMC domestic water supply rate is Rs.8 per m³ ● Cost of 1 kL water is Rs.8 ● Recurring cost for 123 KLD water consumption = Rs.984/day ● Total water supply pipeline cost = Rs.69,513 (As per water connection charges & road cutting charges paid challan_ Annexure-V) 		
	<p>B. Cost of sewage treatment, reuse & disposal:</p>		
	<p>a) Construction phase:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● No. of labours = 100 nos. ● Total water consumption=4.5 KLD ● Sewage generation= 4 KLD ● Cost for capacity of 5 KLD Septic tank = Rs.25,000 (As per regular practice) ● O & M -10% of capital cost/day=Rs.7/day 	25,000	7
	<p>b) Operation phase:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Total Sewage generation of buildings = 173 KLD ● Required STP-182 KLD ● Provided STP capacity for all building = 70 KLD ● Total capital cost of sewage treatment in MBBR is Rs.32,25,000 ● O & M cost/day=Rs.442 ● Cost of 70 KLD sewage treatment in MBBR =Rs.11,25,000 (As per STP work order_ Annexure-VI) ● O & M cost/day = Rs.154/day 	32,25,000	442
	<p>C. Quantity of water pumped out during excavation and a lumpsum cost of Rs. 50 per cum for such unauthorized water extraction and disposal (Ground water was not encountered during excavation and foundation work of completed work.)</p>	Nil	Nil
	<p>C. Cost of construction & maintenance of</p>	2,06,000	28

Attributes	Scope of saving on account of environmental protection measures	Non-recurring cost (Rs.)	Recurring cost, Rs. /day
	<p>recharge well:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No. of required recharge pits= 4 nos. Cost of recharge pit as per DSR 2022-2023 is Rs.51,500 (pg. no.317) i.e. Rs.51,500/recharge pit_ Annexure-VII Construction cost of 4 recharge pits = Rs.2,06,000 On project site we have constructed total 2 nos. of recharge pits Operation and maintenance cost/day= Rs.28/day 		
Soil environment	<p>In case of demolition has carried out, the cost of demolition waste management plan needs to be discussed and finalized as non-recurring cost. Demolition work not done.</p>	Nil	Nil
	<p>In case there is some hazardous waste like asbestos or the site is located on industrial area where hazardous chemical or waste was handled, the cost based on due diligence of the project site, as given by consultants. (The report must include soil analysis, water analysis, MPCB consent copies, manifest of HW if any). This requires critical examination from SPCB.</p>	-	No Hazardous waste generation
	<p>Cost of preservation of top soil& excavated earth to be considered.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Excavated quantity: 920 m³ Cost of excavation of soil as per the CSR 2022-2023 for 1 m³ is Rs.98.90 (pg. no. 21) _ Annexure-VIII Cost for excavation = 920 x 98.90 = Rs.90,988 	90,988	Nil
Noise and Vibration	<p>For damage due to noise pollution & vibration, the cost of barricades around the project site should be considered. [perimeter(m)x height of the barricade (m)x cost of the sheet)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Barricading cost as per DSR 2022-2023 is Rs.5,078 (pg. no. 298) _ Annexure-IX 	91,49,794	Barricading was done during construction. No saving on this item.

Attributes	Scope of saving on account of environmental protection measures	Non-recurring cost (Rs.)	Recurring cost, Rs. /day
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Perimeter (720.74 m) x height of the barricade (2.5 m) x cost of the sheet (Rs.2,539) = Rs. 91,49,794 		
Green Belt	<p>In case of any tree cutting without EC Cost of Rs.10000/-per tree apart from any statutory action for such tree cutting if any, Cost of planting & maintaining trees (Number of trees as per the bye-laws) Cost of compensatory tree plantation (5 trees for each tree cut)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● No. of required trees=218 nos. ● On project site we have planted 392 nos. of trees. ● Labour rates has been considered from the gazette of India circular under Gramin Vikas Mantralay - Rs. 256/ day. Tree sapling rate a has been considered from Krishi Aayuktalay –Maharashtra circular published in 2021 - Rs. 200/ Tree (maximum has been considered) _ Annexure-X ● No trees were cut. ● Tree plantation cost= 392 x 200=Rs.74,800 ● Cost of labour for pits: Pits dug per day=10 no. ● Labor cost=256 x 392/10=Rs.10,035 ● Total cost= Rs.74,800 + Rs.10,035 =Rs.88,435 	88,435	Nil
RH/OHS	Cost of workers benefits to be considered in view of Building and Other Construction Workers Welfare Cess Act,1996		
	<p>A. Cost of health checkups of workers B. Cost of safety measures including PPEs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Cost of Health check-up for labour has been considered as per the full body check-up plans available in the diagnostic centers - Rs.1500/ 	1,99,600	546

Attributes	Scope of saving on account of environmental protection measures	Non-recurring cost (Rs.)	Recurring cost, Rs. /day
	<p>Labour</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Total labour 100 no. ● Cost of PPE has been calculated considering the requirements such as Safety Harness: Rs.1000, Helmet: Rs. 210, Shoes: Rs. 400, Goggles: Rs. 100, Safety Gloves: Rs. 470, Masks and ear plugs: Rs. 100 and First aid Kits: Rs. 200 -Rs.2480 / PPE Kit. ● The Cost of Health check-up for labour has been considered as per the full body check-up plans available in the diagnostic centers - Rs. 1500/ <p>Labour = (100 x 1500 + 2480 x 20) = 1,99,600/-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Total cost=Rs. 1,99,600 		
Total		1,45,70,781	2,568/day

Environmental Management Plan for Operation Phase:

Operational Activities	Potential Impacts	Mitigation Measures
Impact due to Water Consumption & Wastewater Generation	Fresh water consumption	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Use of low flow and low flush – water saving plumbing fixtures, automatic level controllers at water tanks to reduce / optimize the demand side of water resource.
	Sewage generation & disposal problems	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Onsite Sewage Treatment Plant of capacity 70 KLD based on MBBR technology has been provided and 115 KLD will be provided.
Impact due to rainwater discharges	Water Pollution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Rain water harvesting through 3 no. recharge borewell (2 no. existing + 1 no. proposed) ● Rain water & storm water management plan is incorporated. ● Annual Cleaning of Recharge pits, RWH filters and SWD.
	Flooding conditions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Adequate Storm water drains to collect, carry, recharge/discharge storm- water runoff. ● Regular Cleaning of SWD

Operational Activities	Potential Impacts	Mitigation Measures
	Biological Environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Plantation of Native trees along the plot boundary and RG area ● Tree already planted: 392 Nos. ● Landscape area provided: 2,045.85 m²
Impacts due to Solid Waste generation	Land pollution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Separate dustbins for collection of wet & dry waste have been provided. ● Wet garbage has composted using vermicomposting system and used as organic manure for landscaping ● The inorganic material is handed over to authorized vendors.
Impact due to Energy Consumption	Energy Consumption for building utilities and functions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● We have installed solar PV panel for residential building having capacity 135000 KWH/Annum. ● Solar hot water system is provided for buildings having capacity 57420 KWH/Annum ● The site planning has been done such that none of the building blocks are hinder light access to other buildings ● The project is using pumps, motors and transformers with minimum losses and as per the ECBC 2007 requirements.
Parking	Traffic congestion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Proper entry and exit points and driveways are provided for easy movement of vehicles ● Vehicular movement and signages have been installed. ● Adequate parking space is provided
DG set and Traffic	Noise Pollution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Existing DG set: We have installed 1 no. X 82.5 kVA DG set on project site. ● Traffic management measures to reduce noise. ● Plantation along plot boundary, Creepers on Plot boundary
Energy Consumption for Thermal Comfort of people	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Tree plantation done along the periphery of the project site ensuring adequate buffer and reducing heat gain by the building ● The project design uses high energy performing building materials which would have low U value (Thermal Conductance) as compared to the conventional materials. The external wall of proposed building would use fly ash blocks & glass have mandatory SHGC as required by ECBC. 	
Energy Consumption for Lighting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Internal and external lighting designs are provided as required by ECBC with Lighting Power Density as per space requirements. ● The project provides 20% lower LPD than as specified in ECBC, to achieve energy saving, while providing the require illumination levels, by using high efficacy lighting. 	

Operational Activities	Potential Impacts	Mitigation Measures
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Solar PV units of having capacity 135000 KWH/Annum provided for buildings. ● Solar hot water system is provided for buildings having capacity 57420 KWH/Annum. 	
Safety hazards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Transformer or the Sub Station for the project are adequately protected from entry, allowing only authorized personnel to enter the facility ● All required energy protection measures such as high voltage cut-off, shock protector etc. had installed. 	
Impacts due to Cleaning & repairing activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A Manual is created by the PP to make occupants aware of these measures to be undertaken: ● Choose non-toxic, biodegradable substitutes for household cleaning agents. ● Avoid products with potentially harmful ingredients such as sponges with antibacterial ingredients. ● Conserve water, sweep instead of wet mop when possible. ● Use biodegradable drain clog removers made with natural enzymes. ● Don't pour hazardous chemicals through the sink or the drain; Don't use chlorine-based bleach for cleaning ● The regular monitoring & repairing of the equipment's such as STP, DG sets etc. to avoid the sudden failure. ● Cleaning of building premises, parking areas and common areas are doing on a regular basis, taking care to see that no solid waste is carried to the storm water drains. ● Green Guideline Brochure circulated to AMC workers. 	

Budget Allocation for Operation Phase:

Sr.	Component	Details	Capital cost Rs. Lakh	O&M cost Rs. Lakh/year
1.	Storm water management	Laying of storm & Sewer line up to final disposal point	11.00	0.90
2.	Sewage Treatment Plant	1 no. of STP having capacity 70 KLD Existing & 115 KLD to be proposed	32.25	1.6
3.	Rain Water Harvesting	3 no. of recharge Borewell	1.90	0.50
4.	Solid Waste Management	Cost for Treatment of biodegradable garbage in vermicomposting	3.00	0.40

Sr.	Component	Details	Capital cost Rs. Lakh	O&M cost Rs. Lakh/year
5.	Landscape development	Tree Plantation	17.26	1.50
6.	Energy Conservation	Solar PV panels for electricity generation, LED etc.	25.00	2.60
7.	Environmental Monitoring	Monitoring and analysis of Air, Water, Noise, Soil, surface water, STP treated water etc.	5.00	0.50
8.	Firefighting system	Installation and operation of Fire Fighting system	14.50	1.70
	Total		109.91	9.7

Calculation of cost of remediation plan and natural & community resource augmentation plan :

Sr.	Description	Details	Amount
A	Assessment of Environment Damage		
1.	Total of recurring cost	Cost arrived from above table per day X number of days in violation	Rs.2,568/day x violation days 6,083 Nos. = Rs.156 Lakh
2	Non-recurring cost	Cost as arrived from above tables	Rs.146 Lakh
3	Subtotal (1+2 above)	Subject to minimum Rs. 1 Crore	Rs.302 Lakh
4	Excluding Cost of STP, recharge bore well, planted trees, cost of barricades around the project site and O & M cost		Rs.115 Lakh
5	Overall total (3-4 above)		Rs.187 Lakh
B	Economic benefits accrued due to violation		
1.	Economic benefits	1 % of Total project cost including land, as declared by PP before SEAC, subject to maximum Rs. 10 crores	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Total project cost of constructed building is Rs.50.21 Crore • 1% of project cost i.e., Rs.50.21 Lakh

Sr.	Description	Details	Amount
2.	Track record of Project proponent	Incremental cost of Rs. 10 lakhs for each EC violation by PP observed at any other projects in last 3 years.	All directors on board have no track record of other violation
C	Cost of remediation plan and natural community resource augmentation plan	Sum of A & B above or amount equivalent to the MoEF&CC's office Memorandum no. F. No. 22-65/2017-IA-III dated 01/05/2018, whichever is higher.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Sum of A & B – Rs.237.2 Lakh ● As per MoEF&CC's office Memorandum no. F. No. 22-65/2017-IA-III dated 25/02/2021, CER not applicable for B2 category projects. ● Therefore, the cost of remediation plan is Rs.237.2 Lakh which is higher.

Remediation cost bifurcation:

Sr.	Description of Activity	% allocation	Total cost will be spent within one years after the receipt of EC (Rs. In Lakh)	Activities to be done at	Implementing agency	Remarks
1.	Afforestation (can include plantation, garden development)	25%	59.3	Plantation will be done at both sides of roads & garden in the 1 km to 3 km vicinity from the project site.	Social forestry and Local body (Pune Municipal Corporation)	The afforestation can be either through social forestry or the local body. Preferably within 50 km from project site
2.	Water conservation program (Jalyuktshivar, etc.)	25%	59.3	In consultation with Pune Municipal Corporation in the water	Local body (Pune Municipal Corporation)	Preferably within 50 km radius from project site

Sr.	Description of Activity	% allocation	Total cost will be spent within one years after the receipt of EC (Rs. In Lakh)	Activities to be done at	Implementing agency	Remarks
				shortfall areas.		
3.	Urban environment and sanitation (can include swatchta Bharat, playground development, urban ground-water recharge schemes etc.)	20%	47.4	Slum area at Pune village in consultation with respective local authority	Local body (Pune Municipal Corporation)	
4.	Sewerage lines and STP, solid waste management	20%	47.4	Development of sewerage line and STP & solid waste management in slum area of Pune Municipal Corporation.	Local body (Pune Municipal Corporation)	
5.	Urban air/noise Pollution control initiatives	10%	23.7	We will be provided air pollution measure machines & noise barrier in traffic prone areas near project site and also in consultation with Pune Municipal Corporation.	Local body (Pune Municipal Corporation)	
		100%	237.2			

Penalty provision for violation application as per OM dated 07.07.2021 and OM 28.01.2022 under EIA Notification 14.09.2006 for new project as follows:

Sr.	Details	Amount in INR
A.	Project cost attributed to violation area incurred up to the date of filing of the application	Rs.50.21 Crore
B.	1% of A	Rs.50.21 Lakh
C.	Total project turnover during the period of violation	Rs.95.87 Crore
D.	0.25% of the total turnover during the period of violation	Rs.23.97 Lakh
E.	B+D	Rs.74.18 Lakh

(The proposal does not involve sue moto declaration of violation, hence Damage costing (i.e. penalty) was not halved.)

It is noted that,

- As per the Office Memorandum issued by Ministry of Environment Forest and Climate Change vide orders no F.No.22-21/2020-IA.III Dated 7th July 2021, The penalty cost is arrived at **Rs. 74.18 Lakh**
- As per format given in SEIAA Circular, the Damage Assessment value is arrived at **Rs. 237.2 Lakh.**

Decision: Committee decided to recommend the proposal for Environmental Clearance to SEIAA subject to aforementioned observations.



Proof of Service

raghunath mahabal <adv.rbmahabal@gmail.com>

NGT OA 65/2019 (WZ) Ajay Bhosale Vs Uol : Next Date: 06/10/2023 : R-11 BramhaCorp Ltd.: SUBMISSION OF DOCUMENTS

1 message

raghunath mahabal <adv.rbmahabal@gmail.com>

4 October 2023 at 12:48

To: nitinlonkar@gmail.com, Manasi Joshi <adv.manasi.joshi@outlook.com>, Rahul Garg <rahul.garg@mgklegal.com>, secy-moef@nic.in, chiefsecretary@maharashtra.gov.in, psc.env@maharashtra.gov.in, "Principal Secretary Environment Dept. Govt. of Maharashtra" <psec.env@maharashtra.gov.in>, ms@mpcb.gov.in, ropune@mpcb.gov.in, rdc.pune-mh@gov.in, adv.mukeshh@tosslegal.co.in, sropune1@mpcb.gov.in, National Green Tribunal Pune <ngt-pune@gov.in>, ajay bhosale <ajaybhosale2772@gmail.com>, Aniruddha Kulkarni <aniruddha1488@gmail.com>
Cc: Raghunath Mahabal <mahabal60@gmail.com>, admin@bramhacorp.in, Srinivas Reddy <srinivas.reddy@bramhacorp.in>, Adv Sachin S Gore 7350212877 <ssgore2005@gmail.com>, ajay.agrawal@bramhacorp.in, EC BramhaCorp <ec@bramhacorp.in>, adv.mukeshh@tosslegal.co.in

I am pleased to circulate the submissions of documents as above under the subject.

Regards

Dhananjay Chavan 7038383654

= Raghunath Mahabal, Advocate +91-74-0011-6222 [adv.](mailto:adv.rbmahabal@gmail.com)

rbmahabal@gmail.com =

B-202 Chandravijay, Phule Road, Mulund East, Mumbai-400081

| Adv. Sumedha Marathe | Adv. Ashlesha Gondhalekar | Adv. Antima Bazaz New Delhi |



2023-10-04 OA 65_2019 R-11 Bramha.pdf

1255K